

## DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 307 553

CG 021 723

AUTHOR Hoyt, Kenneth B.  
 TITLE Counselors and Career Development--A Topic in Educational Reform Proposals: A Selected Review of National Education Reform Documents.  
 INSTITUTION National Consortium of State Career Guidance Supervisors, Columbus, OH.  
 SPONS AGENCY Ohio State Univ., Columbus. Center on Education and Training for Employment.  
 PUB DATE Mar 89  
 NOTE 21p.  
 PUB TYPE Information Analyses (070) -- Reports - Research/Technical (143)  
 EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.  
 DESCRIPTORS \*Career Counseling; Career Guidance; \*Educational Change; Educational Quality; Elementary Secondary Education; \*Excellence in Education; \*School Counseling; \*School Counselors; School Effectiveness; Trend Analysis  
 IDENTIFIERS \*Reform Efforts

## ABSTRACT

Currently popular national reports calling for educational reform were reviewed and 29 were selected in which it seemed appropriate to assume that the topic of career guidance would be included. This resulted in an overload of reform proposals emphasizing the goal of education as preparation for work. In analysis of the 29 reports it was found that 19 mentioned counselors, counseling, career guidance, and/or career development. Of these 19, nine called for an increased emphasis on guidance and/or increase in the number of counselors and viewed the guidance and counseling movement as part of the solution for educational reform. Eight others criticized the guidance and counseling movement and/or called for massive changes in the ways in which counselors perform their duties. It was clear from this study that the most important function reform leaders see counselors performing lies in the domain of career guidance-including assisting clients in education-work related decisions. (The first appendix contains selected educational reform proposals with quotations that have implications for school counselors; selected reform proposals that implications for school counselors; selected reform proposals that ignore guidance and counseling; and a list of references. The second appendix is a table depicting indicators of the presence and nature of comments regarding guidance and counseling found in the 29 reports.) (ABL)

\*\*\*\*\*  
 \* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made \*  
 \* from the original document. \*  
 \*\*\*\*\*

## **National Consortium of State Career Guidance Supervisors**

**The National Consortium of State Career Guidance Supervisors is a coalition of guidance representatives from participating state and territorial departments of education dedicated to enhancing career guidance and counseling, leadership, research, and dissemination in education. The Consortium's goal is to provide a framework for improving the effectiveness of elementary, secondary and postsecondary programs, counselor education, and supervision and administration of career guidance programs.**

**The objectives of the consortium are as follows:**

- **Provide a vehicle that brings states together to support mutual priorities, ongoing programs, and career development and prevocational services**
- **Promote the improvement and further development of career guidance at all levels of education**
- **Involve business, industry, and government in developing and evaluating quality career guidance programs**
- **Provide a structure through which to seek resources from public and private sources for program improvement and expansion**
- **Provide technical assistance to states in developing their annual and long-term plans related to career guidance and counseling**

### **Board of Directors National Consortium of State Career Guidance Supervisors**

**Joe McDaniel, Mississippi  
Edwin Whitfield, Ohio  
Evelyn Lavaty, Nebraska  
James Conkwright, Georgia  
Belinda McCharen, Oklahoma  
Lynne Hufziger, South Carolina**

**Pat Schwallie-Giddis, Florida  
Betty Wooten, North Carolina  
James Carr, New Hampshire  
Rebecca Dodmond, Virginia  
Paul Peters, California  
Phyllis Lobdell, U.S. Air Force**

**COUNSELORS AND CAREER DEVELOPMENT—  
A TOPIC IN EDUCATIONAL REFORM PROPOSALS**

**A Selected Review of National  
Education Reform Documents**

**Kenneth B. Hoyt  
University Distinguished Professor of Education  
Kansas State University**

**Special Report  
by the  
National Consortium of State  
Career Guidance Supervisors**

**1989**

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE .....	v
INTRODUCTION .....	1
FINDINGS .....	2
IMPLICATIONS .....	3
APPENDIX A SELECTED EDUCATION REFORM PROPOSALS QUOTES WITH IMPLICATIONS FOR SCHOOL COUNSELORS ..	4
REFERENCES .....	11
APPENDIX B INDICATORS OF THE PRESENCE AND NATURE OF COMMENTS REGARDING GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING FOUND IN 29 SELECTED NATIONAL PROPOSALS FOR EDUCATIONAL REFORM ..	12

## PREFACE

The guidance profession since the formation of the National Vocational Guidance Association in 1913 has attempted to be respected for its part in educational improvement. Over these 75 years the guidance field has worked hard to determine its potential and mission to assist the individual taking greater advantage of educational opportunities and preparing for work, family, and leisure roles. Without question, guidance has demonstrated that its contributions in assessment, counseling, life planning, employability, and work transition are vital to any school operation.

Guidance leadership takes various forms and goes through many changes over time. Currently, it is believed that the most effective position of leadership is at the state level where federal and state monies are managed and distributed for educational improvement. Likewise, it is at this policy and leadership level where quality is ensured through curriculum development, standard setting, program leadership, and technical assistance. Secondly, most of the current counselor professional development, research, program experimentation, and general trends in the field occur due to state-level leadership.

Recently, the states, in response to a need for more opportunity to work together, formed a National Consortium for State Career Guidance Supervisors. This partnership forum seeks ways to share information, perform projects, track advances in the field, and help influence policymakers who currently or could in the future affect the field of guidance. It is through publications such as this one that the consortium attempts to communicate with policymakers and guidance program operators.

This monograph is in response to the disappointment felt by state guidance leaders as they have studied the last of reports coming out of the educational reform movement since 1983—disappointment in that the authors have not demonstrated their understanding of and support for guidance and counseling as a needed component for any major educational reform. The enclosed brief description of 29 key reports and crosswalk between issue, agency, and position taken give the reader a quick insight into how guidance is valued nationwide. We hope that each reader will become proactive and write one or two possible letters. Proposed letter #1 is to congratulate the authors and supporting agency for their support and give them additional supportive data. Letter #2 would go to authors and agencies and would serve as a stern criticism for their lack of value and insight. Again, in a positive and professional manner we would enclose some data they could use in the preparation of any new reports.

Harry N Drier  
Executive Secretary  
National Consortium of State Career  
Guidance Supervisors

## **Counselors and Career Development—A Topic in Educational Reform Proposals: A Selective Review of National Education Reform Documents**

Kenneth B Hoyt  
University Distinguished Professor of Education  
Kansas State University

### **INTRODUCTION**

During the decade of the 1970s the primary calls for educational reform came from the career education movement. By the end of that decade, the need for educational reform was generally accepted. As a result, the decade of the 1980s has witnessed a very large number of educational reform proposals. As we near the end of this decade, this kind of effort shows no clear signs of slackening.

For some time, now, many counselors have expressed concern that the guidance and counseling domain in general—and career guidance in particular—has received insufficient emphasis in the most popular and most influential national calls for educational reform (Aubrey, 1984; Hohenstil, 1987, Hoyt, 1985). The basic purpose of this document is to provide data useful to those wishing to test the validity of such fears with special reference to career guidance and counseling.

To do so, a decision was made to review the contents of currently popular national calls for educational reform that center around (1) the K-12 system structure, organization, and function (8 proposals), (2) the goal of education as preparation for work (13 proposals), and (3) needs of one or more specific segments of the K-12 student population (8 proposals). Each of these 29 reform proposals was picked, in part, on the basis of whether or not it seemed appropriate to assume that the topic of "career guidance" would be included within its contents. This has obviously led to a relative overload of reform proposals placing primary emphasis on the goal of education as preparation for work. This purposeful bias was inserted in an attempt to make the topic of "educational reform" most meaningful for career guidance professionals.

### **The Data**

The raw data used in reporting findings, conclusions, and implications from these 29 national reform proposals appears in **appendix A** of this paper. Each is numbered for purposes of referring to it in this paper. Here an attempt has been made to include specific references to those reports in which the terms "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," and/or "career development" appear. Where the report has been issued by an especially powerful national voice, the report is referenced in spite of using none of these terms—such as, when such organizations ignore counselors completely, they are telling us something valuable.

Several of the quotes found in **appendix A** pertain to related topics in which some use of career guidance professionals seems reasonable to anticipate even though that term per se is not found.

## FINDINGS

**Appendix B** summarizes the numbers found in this discussion. By studying this information, readers can acquire a general perspective useful in considering implications of the specific findings reported here

Findings are reported here for each of the three categories identified above in several subcategories including (a) the number of reports using any and/or all of the following terms: "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," or "career development"; (b) the number who call for an increased effort in the guidance/counseling area; (c) the number whose comments regarding the guidance/counseling area are negative; and (d) the number that make no mention of the guidance/counseling area

**Of the 8 reform proposals centering around K-12 education systems in general**, 6 mention one or more of the terms specified above. Of these six, one calls for an increase in counselors (#5), three either criticize counselors or call for major changes in the ways in which counselors are prepared and the ways they function (#2, #10, #11), and two mentioned counselors only in a noncommittal fashion (#12, #4). **One or more** favorable remarks about counseling and/or counselors can be found in three of the five reports (#5, #10, #11). Two of these 8 reform proposals (#20, #29) made no mention of any of the terms specified above. Thus, **only 1 out of 8** of these national reports calls for more counselors without also calling for major changes in the ways in which counselors are prepared and/or function

**Of the 13 reform proposals centering on education as preparation for work**, eight mention one or more guidance terms. Of the eight, six call for increased efforts in the guidance and counseling area (#6, #7, #8, #11, #16, and #19) while two (#1 and #13) either criticize counselors or call for major changes in counselor education and counselor role. Five of these 13 reports (#21, #22, #23, #24, #28) contain no references to the guidance and counseling movement in spite of the fact they speak about career development needs

**Of the 8 reform proposals centering on needs of one or more specific subgroups**, five (#3, #9, #24, #17, and #18) either criticize counselors or call for major changes in counselor education and counselor role. The remaining three proposals in this area (#25, #26, #27) ignore the guidance and counseling movement in their recommendations even though many of the needs they believe should be met are guidance needs

In summary, some mention of "counselors," "counseling," "career guidance," and/or "career development" was found in 19 of the 29 reform proposals studied. Of these 19, 9 call for an increased emphasis on guidance and/or an increase in the number of counselors. These nine appear to view the guidance and counseling movement as part of the needed **solutions** in educational reform. Eight others criticize the guidance and counseling movement and/or call for massive changes in the ways in which counselors perform their duties. Thus, these eight appear to view the guidance and counseling movement as part of the **problem** to be solved by educational reform. Two reports mentioned the word "counselors" without making any recommendations. The remaining 10 national educational reform completely ignore the guidance and counseling movement. It is as though this movement doesn't exist

Two additional findings deserve mention here. One is that five of these reform proposals (#1, #6, #15, #17, #19) call for increased use of classroom teachers as counselors and/or for much closer counselor/teacher working relationships. The other is finding that seven of these reform proposals (#1, #3, #7, #8, #9, #14, #18) call for viewing counselors as members of a comprehensive **support services team**—such as, counselors are justified only when considered part of a broader team effort, not when they stand by themselves as simply one means of helping persons.

## IMPLICATIONS

The guidance and counseling movement has not been completely ignored by the "educational reform" proposals of the 1980s. Counselors can find some comfort in noting that in 9 of the 29 proposals reviewed here, an increased emphasis on guidance and counseling was called for. On the other hand, when one observes that six of these nine favorable recommendations came from proposals centering primary attention around education-work relationships, the picture becomes considerably less positive. Only one out of seven major proposals centering around general reform of the K-12 education system supported an increase in counselors and/or an increased emphasis on the guidance function. It is equally distressing to discover that of those proposals centering on better meeting needs of minorities only two of eight called for an increase in guidance and counseling.

Some of the reform proposals currently still most popular and/or written by agencies/organizations that the guidance and counseling movement needs as strong supporters are found in the list of those who completely (or essentially) ignored the existence of the guidance and counseling movement in their reports. Examples of such agencies and organizations include the following:

- 1 U S Department of Education—(both in its very first report *A Nation at Risk* and in its latest report *American education: Making it work*)
- 2 Committee on Economic Development—(in *Investing in our children: Business and the public schools*)
- 3 National Governors' Association—(both in *Time for Results* and in *Making America work*)
- 4 Education Commission of the States—(in *Reconnecting youth*).

There is no way the guidance and counseling movement will be able to grow as we wish it to so long as influential organization such as those listed above continue to ignore this movement in their educational reform proposals. Each of these groups favors a "team" approach. None has, to date, included counselors on their proposed "team."

Both the emphasis recommending greater involvement of classroom teachers in guidance and the emphasis on viewing guidance and counseling personnel as team members in a comprehensive support services team have great implications for the guidance and counseling movement. It seems highly unlikely that this movement can impact favorably on educational reform so long as it emphasizes primarily the importance of **counselors** and **counseling**. The prime avenues of hope appear to lie in embracing the team concept where counselor efforts are only one segment of a much broader set of attempts to be of help.

Counselors need to become more concerned about how much help comes to those they serve and less concerned about how much credit comes to the counselor. The career guidance movement has expended a great deal of time and energy during the 1980s in an attempt to convince decisionmakers that this movement should be considered a separate and unique **program** equal in status to any other educational **program**. To do so, many leaders in the guidance movement have tried to picture guidance as a "set of services" vs guidance as a "program" as a conceptual choice counselors should make. This has been and will continue to be counterproductive to the goal of involving the guidance movement in the educational reform "bandwagon." If the guidance movement is to become adequately and appropriately involved in educational reform, it must come back to its historical roots and recognize that guidance is a **program of services**—i.e., to a recognition that the words "program" and "services" fit together and are not antagonistic to each other. Guidance must fit in with the global concept of support services if it is to find a firm place in the educational reform movement.

Finally, it is clear that, when the 29 reform proposals chosen for study here are examined, the single most important function reform leaders see counselors performing lies in the domain of career guidance—including assisting clients in educational decisions related to career decisions. When counselors are considered by educational reform leaders this appears to be the prime expectation of such leaders. Thus, career guidance is the domain apparently most open to counselors who desire to become involved in educational reform.

## APPENDIX A

### SELECTED EDUCATION REFORM PROPOSALS: QUOTES WITH IMPLICATIONS FOR SCHOOL COUNSELORS

#1 — *A nation at work: Education and the private sector.* (1984) Washington, DC: National Alliance of Business

(p. 7) *Improving Attitude and Guidance* — " Students need to learn realistic work attitudes and behavior early in life long before students reach dropout age students need vocational exploration to understand and prepare for the world of work "

"Many employers blame poor counseling . . . Counselors need a much greater awareness of the job market and training opportunities we must take the position that every teacher is a counselor we must focus on increasing the knowledge of teachers about the business community and careers offered therein "

(p. 8) "Although business people stressed the importance of parents and instructors in the counseling process, they also indicated they would like to be more involved."

#2 — *A nation prepared: Teachers for the 21st century* (1986) Washington, DC Carnegie Forum on Education and the Economy

(p. 84) "High schools ought to take particular care in counseling poor and minority students to make certain that they do not compromise their prospects for admission to four-year college and universities, by virtue of the courses they select . . . good counseling is indispensable for poor and minority youngsters who often have few others to turn to for advice "

#3 — *An imperiled generation: Saving urban schools* (1988) A Carnegie Foundation special report Princeton, NJ : The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching

(p. 30) "The Transition School—with its attendant counseling and guidance—is, we believe, an idea whose time has come "

(p. 32) "Flexibility depends heavily on good counseling The school is, for many urban youth, the one institution that provides stability in a disintegrating community and, by operating in close alliance with other social service and health agencies, the urban school can help at-risk students confront problems that go beyond the academic "

NOTE. Of the eight basic proposals in their proposed "Urban Schools Program," counseling and guidance was not included (see p 53-54)

#4 — Bennet, Wm J (1988) *American education Making it work*. Washington, DC Superintendent of Documents

(p. 1) The only place the word "counselor" was found is on page 35 where, in describing "Hamilton High School," he says, "Hamilton's drug counselor doesn't think it's right to tell kids what not to do "

#5 Bayer, Ernest L (1983) *High school: A report on secondary education in America*. New York: Harper & Row

(p. 131) "Guidance. A Critical Need"

Where do students turn for advice? The obvious place is the guidance office. But often this leads to frustration. At every school we visited, the counselors were shockingly overloaded. They had little time to talk to students about career choices or even to stay informed themselves."

"Vocational students occasionally get fragments of advice about job prospects, but, more often, they are on their own. Although high school counselors seem somewhat more confident in helping students who are college bound, very often this means talking about how to get into competitive colleges."

"Our conclusion: The American high school must develop a more adequate system of student counseling. Specifically, we recommend that guidance services be significantly expanded; that no counselor should have a caseload of more than one hundred students. Moreover, we recommend that school districts provide a referral service to community agencies for those students seeking more frequent and sustained professional assistance."

#6 — *Building a quality workforce* (1988) A joint initiative of the U.S. Department of Labor, U.S. Department of Education, and U.S. Department of Commerce Washington, DC. Employment & Training Administration, U.S. Department of Labor

(pp. 33-34) Under the heading "Strengthen Our Educational System," five (5) major recommendations were made. In none of these were "counselors" or "counseling" mentioned

(p. 35) Here, eight (8) recommendations are made under the heading "Improve Educational Opportunities and Performance of the Disadvantaged." Once again, the terms "counselor," "counseling," "guidance," or "career development" cannot be found in any of these eight recommendations.

(pp. 39-61) "Community Partnerships That Work" The following quotes come closest to being related to counselors, counseling, and/or career development

A Prince George County, MD

- 1 The Advisory Council for Business and Industry established a Career Education Task Force which has now made recommendations on employability skills . . . and . . . teacher programs. These recommendations include the following:
  - a The school should infuse career education programs throughout every grade level.
  - b Each school should have a fully staffed, fully equipped career center.

B Cincinnati, Ohio

- 1 "The Taft Project provides intensive assistance in . . . improved counseling, mentoring, tutoring, smaller classes, and job programs."
- 2 Under "Instructional improvement," five strategies are included. One of these is listed as "a reduced counselor-student ratio."

C Portland, Oregon

- 1 Includes the STEP (Summer Training and Employment) Program. Of the three basic strategies for this program, one is listed as "personal counseling" and "designed in part to prevent teen pregnancies."

#7 — *Business & education. Partners for the future.* (1985) Washington, DC Chamber of Commerce of the United States

(p. 40) Under *Starting a Business-Education Partnership*, they say "1. What can we do to better assist non-college bound youth . . . work with guidance counselors to identify local employment opportunities?"

NOTE This publication reviews eight major education reform proposals, in none of these review summaries is there one word about counselors.

#8 — Charner, I & Fraser, B. (1987) *Youth and work: What we know, what we don't know, what we need to know.* Washington, DC: William T. Grant Foundation Commission on Work, Family, and Citizenship

(p. 68) "Counselors need to learn how to establish linkages with employers . . . thereby opening up channels of communication between young people's school and work experiences. In addition, school employment offices should offer students who are working or wish to work a full range of counseling and advisory services."

(p. 67) "Young people . . . should have access to a range of information and counseling regarding what to look for in a job; how to make the most of the work experience; what the trade-offs are . . . how to budget their time; how to handle their earnings ; how to deal with pressures of the workplace, how to recognize when and if work begins to interfere with other activities; and what to do about it."

#9 — *Children in need: Investment strategies for the educationally disadvantaged.* (1987) A statement by the Research and Policy Committee of the Committee for Economic Development New York Committee for Economic Development.

(p. 56) "Few large urban schools have adequate guidance staffs . . . Disadvantaged middle school students need much more in-school guidance than their more affluent peers, but they seldom have adequate counseling . . . It is . . . important that low-income, minority youths receive guidance on higher education and future careers . . . businesses can make a contribution through volunteer career counselors and mentors "

(p. 57) "In addition to the need for more qualified guidance counselors, we see three specific areas where the guidance function for at-risk students needs to be improved (1) employment and career opportunities, (2) postsecondary school placement; and (3) psychological needs and family problems."

#10 — *Educating Americans for the 21st century.* (1983). Washington, DC The National Science Board Commission On Precollege Education In Mathematics, Science, and Technology

(p. 41) "Guidance counselors play an important role in academic and career advising of students. School districts must give special consideration to the preparation and responsibilities of those persons who occupy such positions. In addition to competence in the technical areas of advising and counseling, guidance counselors should be selected and trained with appropriate emphasis on their sensitivity and understanding of the Nation's commitment to abolishing discrimination based on race, sex, ethnicity or socioeconomic conditions "

#11 — *Employment policies: Looking to the year 2000*. (1986). Washington, DC: National Alliance of Business

(p. 7) "The workforce will require better labor market information and improved counseling, testing, and assessment services. . . . Youth must be provided information on job opportunities as early as junior high so they can begin to explore careers. Equally as important, they need sound advice based on aptitude tests and other assessment tools concerning those job areas for which they may be best suited. . . . Lack of career knowledge among youth . . . contributes to poor work attitudes and job hopping and affects long-term earnings."

(p. 13) "Beginning at the junior high and middle level schools . . . an ideal time to provide counseling . . . that can relate a student's interests, aptitudes, and skills to the labor market."

(p. 15) "Individuals should have flexibility to choose services and training that reflect occupational interests."

#12 — Goodlad, John L. (1984) *A place called school. Prospects for the future*. New York: McGraw-Hill Book Company

NOTE The words/terms "counselor," "counseling," "guidance," "career guidance," or "career development" appear nowhere in the index of this book. The only time "counselors" are mentioned is as follows:

(p. 311) "The central concept is that each house is to be characterized by its own curriculum, students, faculty, and counselors."

(pp. 343-346) "Career education and the world of work"—In this section, Goodlad suggests replacing traditional "vocational education" with what he calls "experience-based career education" available K-12 to all students and involving collaborative private sector/education system relationships. An illustrative quote is

(p. 344) "From the early years on, schools should and can play a useful role in the development of a mature perspective on careers, career choice, and basis of career decision making."

NOTE Even here, the words "counselor" or "counseling" do not appear.

#13 — *High schools and the changing workplace: The employers' view*. (1984). Washington, DC: National Academy Press

(p. 32) "Career guidance should go beyond merely providing information on specific jobs or industries quite late in a student's school career. Guidance should include academic, social, and personal concerns as well as the cultivation of attitudes and habits conducive to success in the world of work. Students need to understand the work ethic—that work is a central reality of life—one that, in addition to providing income, can pay well in satisfaction and self-esteem."

#14 McCarty, Joan & Carrera, John. (1988). *New voices: Immigrant students in U.S. public schools*. Boston: National Coalition of Advocates for Students.

(p. 102) One of the six kinds of "comprehensive support services" recommended is: "ACCESS TO COMPREHENSIVE VOCATIONAL COUNSELING."

(p. 103) "A special Commission on Precollege Guidance and Counseling of the College Board found that counseling and guidance programs in the schools are often in a state of disrepair . . . (and) those who most need quality counseling services are often least likely to get it. . . . (We) support these findings. . . . Additionally, action is needed to meet the special needs of immigrant students. For these students, the guidance department may be a crucially important place . . . Availability of quality, comprehensible counseling services for immigrant students is essential."

NOTE: On pp. 103-104, each of the eight recommendations of the College Board Commission on Guidance and Counseling is listed followed by a specific supplementary recommendation for implementation with minority youth.

#15 — Sizer, Theodore, R. (1984). *Horace's compromise: The dilemma of the American high school*. Boston: Houghton-Mifflin Company

(p. 137) "Counselors today act either as administrators, arranging schedules and job and college interviews and the like, or as teachers, coaching and questioning young people about their personal concerns. Good teachers are good counselors, in that second sense; students turn to them for help, whether or not their titles identify them as 'guidance' people. Most high school guidance departments are overloaded with obligations, many of which are contradictory . . . A decenteralized school, with small academic units has less need for specialized counseling offices; improved faculty-student ratios make this possible. The administrative obligations now traditionally handled by such offices can be placed directly under the principal. Staff members who are well trained in counseling and testing skills can support the teachers in each small academic unit."

#16 — Smith, T., Walker, G., & Baker, R. (1987). *Youth and the workplace: Second-chance programs and the hard-to-serve*. Washington, DC: William T. Grant Foundation Commission on Work, Family, and Citizenship.

(p. 39) "The fields of counseling, education, social work and psychology are ample sources for materials and ideas. These fields have not been systematically explored or assessed from the perspective of second-chance programs . . . efforts to examine those fields for their lessons in second-chance programming deserve support."

#17 — *The forgotten half: Non-college youth in America*. (1988). Interim Report. Washington, DC: The Wm. T. Grant Foundation Commission on Work, Family, and Citizenship.

(pp. 54-55) "School counseling is the wailing wall of American education. . . . Outsiders complain that it is ineffective, biased, and a waste of money. . . . Even school counselors admit that too much of their time is spent on paperwork."

"Short of a new profession, there are at least three other options for change. One would be . . . to double the number of counselors . . . Second, there could be a redefinition of teachers' roles . . . so that teachers assume a larger role in . . . counseling . . . students. . . . The professional counselor's role would be to train and assist teachers. . . . A third approach would be to abandon the whole idea of school counselors and to locate counselors elsewhere."

"One model . . . employs job training specialists in schools." All of these proposals are costly. . . . Still . . . each community will need to explore which . . . can be implemented in place of the current paucity of reliable counseling and information services."

#18 — *The forgotten half: Pathways to success for America's youth and young families* (1988). Final report. Washington, DC: Wm. T Grant Foundation Commission on Work, Family, and Citizenship.

(p 8) Under "targeted needs," the five needs of out-of-home youth listed include "counseling"—five needs of at-risk families include "improved counseling."

(p 44) "In one study . . . teachers and guidance counselors were sought out, only in relation to quite circumscribed issues, those having to do specifically with academic performance or, often, substance abuse."

(p. 44) "FOCUS ON YOUTH," a project of the Los Angeles Educational Partnership . . . (includes) counselors in 19 areas . . . schools get to know students and their families, make referrals to community agencies and help out with special home or school problems . . . In one high school, students who participated in the program for three years had only a five percent dropout rate—fully thirty points less than the school-wide average"

(p 124) Under "Pathways to Success" recommendations, "improved counseling" is listed as one of five needed "individualized services"

(p 133) Under "Ingredients of success in expanding educational opportunity," nine (9) elements are listed as needed. One of these 9 is "individual counseling and life planning skills instruction."

#19 — *The unfinished agenda: The role of vocational education in high school.* (1984). Columbus, OH: The National Commission on Secondary Vocational Education.

(p 10) "We need comprehensive career guidance programs that will provide this information . . . available to all students, covering all subjects, and leading to all occupations. . . . We cannot achieve this goal . . . when counselors must deal . . . with 400 or more students. Nor, unless counselors and teachers cooperate . . . to facilitate the career development of students . . . unless counselors expand their use of group techniques, computer-assisted guidance, comprehensive information systems, and counselors must serve as a resource to integrate career guidance concepts in the classroom."

#### **SELECTED REFORM PROPOSALS THAT IGNORE GUIDANCE & COUNSELING**

#20 — *A nation at risk: The imperative for educational reform.* (1983) Washington, DC: The National Commission on Excellence in Education.

(p 13) "Our goal must be to develop the talents of all to their fullest. Attaining that goal requires that we expect and assist all students to work to the limits of their capabilities."

#21 — *America's competitive challenge. A report from the Business-Higher Education Forum.* (1983) Washington, DC: The Forum

NOTE Nothing could be found here referring to "counselors," "counseling," "career guidance," or "career development."

#22 — *Investing in our children. Business and the public schools.* (1985) A statement by the research and policy committee of the Committee for Economic Development New York Committee for Economic Development.

"Employers . . . decry the lack of preparation for work among the nation's high school graduates Many high school graduates are virtually unemployable "

(p. 3) "The central purpose of education is to develop the potential of every student, regardless of race, sex, or physical handicap "

"One of the most important ways people can realize their potential is through productive and rewarding work."

In discussing exemplary efforts, one of those discussed is "The Boston Compact" Among the findings is the following

"A career specialist, who works for the PIC, and is paid with school department funds, is in nearly every high school, helping young people prepare for, find, and succeed in employment"

#23 — Kerns, D. & Doyle, D. (1988). *Winning the brain race: A bold plan to make our schools competitive.* San Francisco. ICS Press.

Nowhere in this major reform proposal is there mention of "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," or "career development." On "vocational education," the following quote is illustrative

(p. 4) "Lest readers think that I'm interested in vocational education let me assure you that nothing could be further from the truth . . . the last thing Xerox and other high-tech companies need is vocational education. We need employees who are . . . 'liberally' educated . . . flexibility, adaptability, inventiveness, even playfulness

#24 — *Making America work: Productive people, productive policies* (1988). Follow-up report 1988 Washington DC National Governors' Association

The words "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," and/or "career development" were not found in this important report

#25 — Miller, S., Nicolaus, S., Orr, M., Valdivieso, R., & Walker, G. (1988) *Too late to patch* Reconsidering second-chance opportunities for Hispanics and other dropouts Washington, DC Hispanic Policy Development Project.

While no mention is made of the words "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," or "career development," the following quote is indicative of the fact that disadvantaged youth have what we would call career development needs:

(p. 45) "We wish . . . to underscore the crucial need (for youth, Grade 6—Grade 12) to (1) know what kinds of jobs are available and what skills these jobs require; (2) understand that they have to 'give', i.e., work to learn, in order to 'get'; (3) perceive that . . . local business is concerned about their education and their skills; and (4) gain experience in working so . . . they can see a . . . relationship between education and job opportunities and between hard work and success"

#26 — *One-third of a nation*. (May, 1988) A report of the commission on Minority Participation in Education and American Life Washington, DC American Council on Education.

Nowhere in this eloquent plea for providing appropriate equity of educational and career opportunities to minorities are counselors or counseling mentioned as one of the possible sources of assistance to be tried

#27 — *Reconnecting youth: The next stage in reform* (1985). A report from the business advisory commission of the Education Commission of the States. Denver, CO: Education Commission of the States

NOTE Neither counseling and guidance nor counselors are mentioned in this report. However, on page 17, the following list they call "indicators of growing youth problems" is presented:

- 1 **Children in poverty** — Up from 16% in 1970 to 22% in 1985. Almost half of Black children and one-third of Hispanic children live in poverty.
- 2 **Drug and alcohol abuse** - Up 60-fold since 1960.
- 3 **Teenage pregnancy** — Up 109% for Whites, 10% for non-whites since 1960.
- 4 **Unmarried mothers** — Up from less than 1% in 1970 to over 6% today.
- 5 **Female headed households** — Up from 12% in 1970 to 23% in 1984.
- 6 **Teenage homicide** — Up more than 200% for Whites, 16% for non-Whites since 1950
- 7 **Teenage suicide** — Up more than 150% since 1950
- 8 **Teenage crime** — Arrests up from 18% in 1960 to 34% in 1980 (18 to 24 year olds)
- 9 **Teenage unemployment** — Up 35% for non-Whites, 60% for Whites since 1961.

Certainly, it seems reasonable to believe professional counselors could make some positive contributions toward alleviating these kinds of youth problems

#28 — *The fourth R: Workforce readiness*. A guide to business-education partnerships. Washington, DC National Alliance of Business.

Nowhere in this report could the terms "counselor," "counseling," "career guidance," or "career development" be found

#29 — *Time for results: The governors' 1991 report on education*. (1986). Washington, DC National Governors' Association

NOTE This historic and very significant document does not discuss the topic of counseling and guidance nor the need for counselors of any kind. The entire counseling and guidance movement is ignored in this report.

#### REFERENCES

Aubrey, R (1984) Reform in schooling: Four proposals on an educational quest. *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 63(4), 204-213.

Hohenshil, T. (1987) The educational reform movement. What does it mean for counseling? *Journal of Counseling and Development*, 66(1) 57-58.

Hoyle, K. (1985). Career guidance educational reform, and career education. *Vocational Development Quarterly*, 34(1) 6-14.

## APPENDIX B

### INDICATORS OF THE PRESENCE AND NATURE OF COMMENTS REGARDING GUIDANCE AND COUNSELING FOUND IN 29 SELECTED NATIONAL PROPOSALS FOR EDUCATIONAL REFORM

Number/Name of Report	"Counselor" "Counseling" "Guidance" Mentioned	Call for Increase in Resources	Favorable Remarks about Counselors	Critical of Current Practice	Recommended Changes	Counselors in a Support Services Team	Emphasis on Teachers as Counselors
1 A Nation at Work	Yes			Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
2 A Nation Prepared	Yes		Yes			Yes	
3 An Imperiled Generation	Yes						Yes
4 American Education: Making it Work		Yes – (BUT only in a "passing comment" manner)					
5 High School: A Report on Secondary Education	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
6 Building a Quality Workforce	Yes	Yes	Yes			Yes	Yes
7 Business & Education: Partners for the Future	Yes			Yes			Yes
8 Youth and Work	Yes					Yes	Yes
9 Children in need	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes		Yes
10 Educating Americans for the 21st Century	Yes		Yes			Yes	
11 Employment Policies: Looking to the Year 2000	Yes	Yes				Yes	
12 A Place Called School		Yes – (BUT only in a "passing comment" manner)					

## APPENDIX B (continued)

Number/Name of Report	"Counselor"	Call for Increase in Resources	Favorable Remarks about Counselors	Critical of Current Practice	Recommended Changes	Counselors in a Support Services Team	Emphasis on Teachers as Counselors
	"Counseling"						
"Guidance"	Mentioned						
13 High School and the Changing Workplace		Yes		Yes	Yes		
14 New Voices		Yes		Yes	Yes	Yes	
15 Horace's Compromise		Yes		Yes	Yes		Yes
16 Youth & the Workplace		Yes	Yes				
17 The Forgotton Half (Interim Report)	Yes	Yes		Yes	Yes		Yes
18 The Forgotten Half (Final Report)	Yes	Yes				Yes	
19 The Unfinished Agenda	Yes	Yes			Yes		Yes

### Selected National Reform Proposals that Ignore Guidance and Counseling

- 20 A Nation at Risk: The Imperative for Educational Reform
- 21 America's Competitive Challenge: A Report From the Business-Higher Education Forum
- 22 Investing in Our Children: Business and the Public Schools
- 23 Winning the Brain Race: A Bold Plan to Make Our Schools Competitive
- 24 Making America Work: Productive People, Productive Policies
- 25 Too Late to Patch: Reconsidering Second-chance Opportunities for Hispanics and Other Dropouts
- 26 One-Third of a Nation
- 27 Reconnecting Youth: The Next Stage in Reform
- 28 The Fourth "R": Workforce Readiness
- 29 Time for Results: The Governors' 1991 Report on Education

*Prepared by: K. Hoyt, College of Education, Kansas State University*

## **THE CENTER MISSION STATEMENT**

**The mission of the Center on Education and Training for Employment is to facilitate the career and occupational preparation and advancement of youth and adults by utilizing The Ohio State University's capacity to increase knowledge and provide services with regard to the skill needs of the work force.**

**The Center fulfills its mission by conducting applied research, evaluation, and policy analyses and providing leadership development, technical assistance, curriculum development, and information services pertaining to:**

- **impact of changing technology in the workplace and on the delivery of education and training**
- **quality and outcomes of education and training for employment**
- **quality and nature of partnerships with education, business, industry, and labor**
- **opportunity for disadvantaged and special populations to succeed in education, training, and work environments**
- **short- and long-range planning for education and training agencies**
- **approaches to enhancing economic development and job creation**
- **individual and government career and training assessment, planning and transition**